

ONLINE APPENDIX

The impact of affirmative action in India and the United States

A systematic literature review

WIDER Working Paper 2023/15

Simone Schotte, Tharcisio Leone, and Rachel M. Gisselquist¹

January 2023

¹ Corresponding author: simone.schotte@finnoc.fi

Supplementary material

Table S1: List of studies, India

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Bagde et al. (2016) (Journal: <i>American Economic Review</i>)	India	Education: Admissions quotas in higher education (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	1st Order: College matriculation 2nd Order: Academic success	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	Positive (+) Affirmative action increases college attendance among targeted students, with proportionally largest effects for the most disadvantaged castes.	Positive (+) Improved priority in college selection allows targeted students to attend higher-quality colleges, which in turn increases first-year achievement. The study finds no evidence of "mismatch" that harms intended beneficiaries.	n.a.	n.a.
Bamrah and Girdhar (2015) (Working Paper)	India	Education: Reservation policy (RP) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: Linear regression	Positive (+) Hypothesis testing performed through z-test supported that the reservation policy favours the enrolment of reserved category students.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Basant and Sen (2020) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Development Studies</i>)	India	Education: Central Educational Institutions (Reservations in Admissions) Amendment Bill (Quota)	Caste: OBC	1st Order: Enrolment	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) The intent-to-treatment effect is positive and statistically significant in the newly exposed states (eastern region).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Bertrand et al. (2010) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Economics</i>)	India	Education: Admission quotas in engineering colleges (Quota)	Caste: SC, OBC	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education 2nd Order: (Future) labour market outcomes	Estimation: OLS and IV	Positive (+) Even though applicants are positively selected from the population, caste-based targeting does result in the redistribution of education resources to those who are more economically disadvantaged.	Positive (+) Despite much lower entry exam scores, those who are admitted by AA economically benefit from attending engineering college.	Negative (-) Targeting by caste may lead to the exclusion of other disadvantaged groups (e.g., reduction in the overall number of females entering engineering colleges).	Negative (-) The income losses experienced by displaced upper-caste applicants are larger than the income gains experienced by displacing

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
									lower-caste students.
Bhattacharjee (2019) (Mimeo)	India	Education: Admission quotas in central government funded colleges (Quota)	Caste: OBC	1st Order: College enrolment 2nd Order: high school completion rates	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) College enrolments among OBS students increased relative to students from both other beneficiary (SC/ST) and non-beneficiary groups	Positive (+) The AA policy had significant positive spillover effects on high school completion rates and school enrolments in higher grades for OBC students.	Insignificant The analyses in this paper do not reveal any worsening of outcomes for non-beneficiary groups.	Insignificant The analyses in this paper do not reveal any worsening of outcomes for non-beneficiary groups.
Bhavnani and Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>American Journal of Political Science</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Admission quotas in bureaucracy (public service) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	2nd Order: Bureaucratic Performance	Estimation: OLS and 2SLS	n.a.	Insignificant The data suggest that disadvantaged group members recruited via AA perform no worse than others.	n.a.	n.a.
Boroah (2019) (Book / book chapter)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation for jobs in government and the public sector (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	1st Order: Regular salaried and wage employment (RSWE)	Estimation: Multinomial logit	Positive (+) Positive discrimination in the public sector in favour of men from the SC was much stronger than negative discrimination against their counterparts in the private sector.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) It is those from the SC who are the net gainers, and those from the FC who are the net losers of job reservation policies.
Cassan (2019) (Journal: <i>Journal of Development Economics</i>)	India	Education: SC and ST Orders (Amendment) Act of 1976	Caste: SC	2nd Order: Education level, school completion, literacy	Estimation: DID	n.a.	Positive (+) The paper finds an overall important but imprecisely estimated effect of AA, which may have led to an increase in literacy of 10 ppts and in secondary attainment of 7 ppts. It finds no statistically significant increase in higher education.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Deshpande and Ramachandran (2019) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Extension of quotas in government employment to OBCs in 1993 (Quota)	Caste: OBC	1st Order: Occupation shares 2nd Order: Secondary school completion	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) AA had the directed intended effect of increasing the share of OBCs with public sector jobs.	Positive (+) AA also had an indirect incentive effect of increasing the probability of completing secondary schooling, a minimum qualification necessary to be able to access government positions.	n.a.	n.a.
Deshpande and Weisskopf (2014) (Journal: <i>World Development</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation policies in the public sector (Indian Railways) (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	2nd Order: Productivity	Estimation: Fixed effects (FE) and Lev-Pet regression	n.a.	Insignificant Higher proportions of SC/ST employment have not hurt—and may even have helped—total factor productivity.	n.a.	n.a.
Frisancho and Krishna (2016) (Journal: <i>Higher Education</i>)	India	Education: Reservation policies in higher education (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST	1st Order: Targeting 2nd Order: Catch-up, and mismatch	Estimation: PSM	Positive (+) Admission preferences effectively target minority students who are poorer than average displaced non-minority students.	Negative (-) Minority students, especially those in more selective majors, fall behind their same-major peers in terms of grades as they progress through college.	n.a.	n.a.
Gill (2002) (Journal: <i>Social Change</i>)	India	Education / Employment / Business: Article 16(4) and 335 (Quota)	Caste: SC, OBC	2nd Order: Social and economic mobility	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) The reservation policy has provided avenues of social and economic mobility through educational and occupational opportunities to the lower under-privileged castes.	n.a.	n.a.
Gille (2013) (Mimeo)	India	Education: Reservation Policies (Quota)	Caste: OBC	2nd Order: Application for reserved places	Estimation: OLS	n.a.	Negative (-) Stigma plays a significant role in preventing households from locally high ranked	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							groups to apply for reservation.		
Gulzar et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>American Political Science Review</i>)	India	Employment / Business: National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (NREGS)	Caste: ST	1st Order: Workdays	Estimation: RDD	Positive (+) NREGS delivery improves substantially for the targeted minorities (ST), who receive 24.2% more workdays in Scheduled Areas.	n.a.	Insignificant No evidence that the quota causes a change in employment for the non-targeted, historically disadvantaged minorities (SC).	Negative (-) Improvement appears to come primarily at the cost of work for non-minorities (non-SC/ST), who receive 11.5% fewer workdays.
Higham and Shah (2013a) (Journal: <i>Focaal—Journal of Global and Historical Anthropology</i>)	India	Education: Quota system (Quota)	Caste: ST	2nd Order: Secondary school outcomes	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	n.a.	Positive (+) Adivasi access to and attainment in secondary school increased over time, as the secondary sector expanded in Ranchi district and Jharkhand more generally.	n.a.	n.a.
Higham and Shah (2013b) (Journal: <i>Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Caste-based reservations (Quota)	Caste: ST	1st Order: Public employment 2nd Order: Educational outcomes	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+) By 2009, while older adivasis continued to pursue only farming and manual wage labour, a small but significant minority of the 21–30-year-old age cohort had, for the first time, secured state-sector jobs (that historically local elites would have dominated).	Positive (+) In 2009 the vast majority of adivasis over the age of 30 remained illiterate. A small proportion had completed primary or middle school but no one had achieved a Matriculation (Matric) pass. By contrast, among 21–30-year-olds, 16 out of 65, or 25%, had passed Matric.	n.a.	n.a.
Howard and Prakash (2012) (Journal:)	India	Employment / Business: Employment quotas in public sector jobs	Caste: SC, ST	2nd Order: Occupational structure	Estimation: Multinomial logit models	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) Unequal effects on the overall occupational structure of each minority population: The	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>International Review of Applied Economics</i>)		(Quota)					SCs are more likely to choose high-skill occupations and less likely to choose low- and middle-skill occupations, while STs display the opposite pattern. This suggests that there is competition between the two populations for high-skill employment, and that STs are possibly subject to greater labor market discrimination for these occupations.		
Khanna (2020) (Journal: <i>Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Caste-based reservations at the central level	Caste: OBC	2nd Order: Years of Education	Estimation: RDD and DID	n.a.	Positive (+) The estimators consistently show that affirmative action incentivizes about 0.8 additional years of education for the average minority group student and 1.2 more years of education for a student from a marginal minority subgroup.	Insignificant These effects are absent among ineligible minorities, ineligible candidates within the eligible minority groups, and low-income students from ineligible upper castes.	n.a.
Kumar et al. (2019) (Journal: <i>Journal of Asian and African Studies</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation in government jobs (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	1st Order: Representation	Estimation: Logit model	Positive (+) The policy has helped in increasing the chances of representation of people from target groups.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
A. Lee (2021) (Journal: <i>Comparative Political Studies</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservations for OBCs	Caste: OBC	1st Order: Years of Education 2nd Order:	Estimation: DID and DDD	Positive (+) The implementation of OBC reservation is associated with an increase in government employment of between 5	Positive (+) Reservations increased the education level of OBCs, though these effects appear to have been modest in	Insignificant Reservations did not decrease the achievement levels of other groups.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
				Government Employment		and 7 pts relative to the declining trend among non-OBCs (though this may be a result of other social and political trends).	substantive size—an increase of approximately three quarters of a year of education in the immediate aftermath of the policy, growing slightly in subsequent years.		
Sabharwal et al. (2020) (Journal: <i>Gender and Education</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Recruitment for academic positions (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	2nd Order: Participation in conferences (hidden social exclusion)	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	n.a.	Negative (-): The analysis of administrative records found that access to conferences was proportionally lower for women and marginalised caste groups than their representation at faculty level.	n.a.	n.a.
Sheth (2004) (Working paper)	India	Employment / Business: Reservations (Quota)	Caste: SC, ST, OBC	2nd Order: Enrolment (ratios), Literacy, Drop-out, Admission in higher education, Representation in public employment	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) Reservations have helped the SCs, STs and the OBCs. By providing a concrete basis to their mobility aspirations, it has induced them to achieve higher levels of literacy and living standards.	n.a.	n.a.
Xaxa (2001) (Journal: <i>Economic and Political Weekly</i>)	India	Employment / Business: Reservation policy	Caste: SC, ST	1st Order: Seats in parliament/state legislatures, employment in government services and admission in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The SCs have, in general, fared better than the STs in achieving the reserved places.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Source: authors' elaboration.

Table S2: List of studies, United States

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Alon and Tienda (2005) (Journal: <i>Sociology of Education</i>)	United States	Education: Racial quotas for college admissions (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	2nd Order: Graduation rate within six years of enrolment	Estimation: DID with Propensity scores	n.a.	Positive (+) The study rejects the mismatch hypothesis for students who enrolled at the most selective institutions during the late 1980s and early 1990s. Conditional on admission, all groups of students who attended selective institutions were more likely to graduate within six years of enrolment than their counterparts who attended less-selective colleges.	n.a.	n.a.
Alon (2015) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Hypothetical comparison of race- vs- class-based AA (simulation)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: College admission 2nd Order: Graduation	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) The level of racial diversity at elite colleges would substantially decline if class-based policies replaced race-based ones.	Positive (+) Black and Hispanic freshman beneficiaries of race-conscious admissions at elite schools were more likely than their peers at less-selective schools to continue into their second year and to graduate.	n.a.	n.a.
Arcidiacono and Lovenheim (2016) (Journal: <i>Journal of Economic Literature</i>)	United States	Education: Consideration of race as one of many factors in university admissions	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Admission to selective undergraduate education / law schools 2nd Order: Enrolments to less selective schools	Descriptive: Comparison in means	Positive (+) Black applicants were admitted to Michigan's law school in 2002 at a slightly higher rate than white students, despite the average academic index of black applicants being ca. 1.5 standard deviations lower than the mean white applicant.	Mixed (+/-) ^E Reshuffling some African American students to less selective schools would improve some outcomes due to match effects dominating quality effects. However, shifting minority undergraduates to low-resource, nonselective schools ultimately may	n.a.	Negative (-) The white students who were rejected generally look academically stronger than the black students who were admitted.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							undo any gains from higher match quality.		
Arcidiacono (2005) (Journal: <i>Econometrica</i>)	United States	Education: (Removing) preferential treatment in university admissions and in financial aid. (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Educational choices 2nd Order: Future earnings	Estimation: Structural model	Positive (+)^R Removing race-based advantages in admissions substantially decreases the number of black students at top-tier schools. Removing advantages in financial aid causes a decrease in the number of blacks who attend college.	Insignificant Removing preferential treatment for blacks in admissions and in financial aid shows little effect on earnings.	n.a.	n.a.
Arcidiacono et al. (2014) (Journal: <i>IZA Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Education: Proposition 209 that removed preferential university admissions (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	2nd Order: Graduation rates and academic preparation	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	n.a.	Negative (-)^R The graduation rates of minorities increased after Prop 209, especially for those students in the bottom part of the distribution of academic preparation (matching, behavioural response, and selection).	n.a.	n.a.
Ayres and Brooks (2004) (Journal: <i>Stanford Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Admissions quotas in higher education (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks	2nd Order: Expected number of black lawyers and probability that black students will become lawyers	Estimation: Linear Probability Model	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) The analyses provide mixed support for the academic mismatch hypothesis in law schools, with results showing no mismatch effect, some supporting a mismatch effect, others pointing to a reverse mismatch effect. The study found no compelling evidence that the system of AA in place in 1991 reduced the number of black lawyers.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Barlow and Villarejo (2004) (Journal: <i>Journal of research in science teaching</i>)	United States	Education: Biology Undergraduate Scholars Program (BUSP)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Persistence and performance in basic math and science courses and graduation outcomes	Estimation: Multivariate linear and logistic regression models	Positive (+) Greatly improved persistence and performance of minority students in basic math and science courses (due to supplemental instruction and possibly other, unmeasured, facets of the program).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Berry (2004) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management</i>)	United States	Education: AA programs in higher education	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Perception of institutional barriers	Estimation: Regression using the effectiveness to barriers model	Positive (+) Compared to whites, minority AA officers are more likely to perceive that institutional barriers interfere with their role. A larger AA budget does not necessarily reduce the effect of institutional barriers. However, as the size of the AA staff increases, the effect of institutional barriers decreases. The benefits of an AA program that has been fully integrated into mission of the institution continue to outweigh the costs.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Bleemer (2022) (Journal: <i>The Quarterly Journal of Economics</i>)	United States	Education: (Removing) Lower admission threshold for minority applicants	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st order: Enrolment 2nd Order: Course performance, choice of major, degree attainment	Estimation: DID (complemented by RDD and institutional value-added analyses)	Positive (+)^R Ending AA caused underrepresented minority (URM) applicants to enrol at lower-quality colleges.	Positive (+)^R Contrary to the mismatch hypothesis, URM applicants' degree attainment declined overall and in STEM fields. URM applicants' average wages in their twenties and thirties declined (driven by declines among Hispanic group).	n.a.	Insignificant White and Asian students just below Berkeley's admissions threshold attained similar educational and labour market outcomes after

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
									enrolling at other universities.
Burstein and Edwards (1994) (Journal: <i>Law and Society Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Relative earnings of blacks and whites	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Blacks' relative earnings rose along with victories in court through the mid-1970s.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Button and Rienzo (2003) (Journal: <i>Social Science Quarterly</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Employer support of AA	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Black employment	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) Employer support for AA has a significant and positive effect on black employment, particularly at higher job levels.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Caldwell (2009) (Journal: <i>University of Kansas Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: California's Proposition 209 and the Hopwood v. Texas decision	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Admission in Higher Education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R The year AA ended, the black-white admissions rate gap more than doubled and has since remained around 15-20%. The percentage of total admits who were black also fell dramatically around the time of the end of AA and has continued to remain low.	n.a.	Negative (-)^R With the end of AA, the admission rates for Asians increased slightly from 84.2% in 1997 to 85% in the fall of 1998.	Negative (-)^R With the end of AA, the admission rates for whites increased slightly from 81.8% in 1997 to 83.8% in the fall of 1998.
Chambers et al. (2005) (Journal: <i>Stanford Law Review</i>)	United States	Education: Elimination of AA in admission to law schools (simulation)	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Enrolment in law schools 2nd Order: Production of lawyers (graduation and entering the bar exam)	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R Ending AA would have cut by about 32.5% the numbers of African Americans who would have been admitted to any accredited law school.	Positive (+)^R Without AA the number of African American students passing the bar and becoming lawyers would reduce in the range of 30-40% each year. Particularly the elimination of AA in admissions at elite law schools would be likely to substantially diminish African American representation in	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
							leadership positions such as partners in corporate law firms, professors teaching at law schools, and federal judges.		
Charles (2003) (Journal: <i>Public Personnel Management</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Managing diversity	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Representative bureaucracy	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) Since 1975, the number of minority employees in the state of New Jersey government workforce has increased from 20% to 35%.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Chatterji et al. (2014) (Journal: <i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Reservation of a proportion of government contracts for minority-owned businesses (City Set-Aside Programs) (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Self-employment and employment rates	Estimation: DID and event study	Positive (+) Black business ownership rates increased significantly after program initiation, with the black-white self-employment gap falling by 3 ppts (35–40%). The racial gap in employment fell by roughly 4 ppts after program initiation.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) It appears that city programs led to a reallocation of self-employment from white to black men, as there is little change in the aggregate rates.
Conrad and Sharpe (1996) (Journal: <i>The Review of Black Political Economy</i>)	United States	Education: Ending AA in admissions to the California State University system (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Admission in higher education 2nd Order: Returns to schooling and service delivery	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R Ending AA will, in the short run, reduce the number of minority students admitted. It will also redistribute minority students from the most competitive towards less competitive campuses.	Positive (+)^R This redistribution will lower the returns to schooling for affected groups. A lower number of minority graduates in law and medicine may negatively affect the delivery of legal and health care services to minority communities.	Negative (-)^R The number of Asian American students will increase with the removal.	Negative (-)^R The number of white students enrolled will also increase, but only slightly.
Contreras (2005) (Journal: <i>Educational Policy</i>)	United States	Education: Ending AA in admissions to University of California	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Admission in Higher Education 2nd Order: Class biases	Estimation: Logistic regression	Positive (+)^R With Prop 209, educational equity and access continues to shift further away from a level that is adequately	Positive (+)^R Class biases may have emerged (minority students with higher incomes and higher parent education had a	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
		(Proposition 209) (Quota)				representative of all groups.	greater likelihood to be part of the admit pool).		
Detterman (2000) (Journal: <i>Psychology, Public Policy, and Law</i>)	United States	Education: AA policies in education	Race/colour: Blacks	2nd Order: College completion and income	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Negative (-) Median salaries of white college graduates between 25 and 34 years declined by 14%, while those of Black college graduates in the same age range declined by 24%. If AA is working, it is working in the wrong direction.	n.a.	n.a.
Dobbin and Kalev (2015) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Employment / Business: Diversity managers, diversity taskforces and AA plans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Managerial diversity	Estimation: Fixed effects	Positive (+) Diversity managers and task forces have strong positive effects on managerial diversity in firms. AA plans have weaker effects.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) Diversity taskforces show a significant negative effect on white men in management.
Dometrius and Sigelman (1984) (Journal: <i>Public Administration Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Equal Employment Opportunity Act	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Representation and salary inequalities	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) State and local governments are doing a better job than the private sector both in increasing the share of positions blacks hold and in providing them with salaries closer to those of white males.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
DuBois (2015) (Journal: <i>American Law and Economics Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: National Football League's (NFL) "Rooney Rule"	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Hiring as Head Coach	Estimation: DID with OLS	Positive: A minority candidate is a statistically significant 19–21% more likely, depending on the comparison group, to fill an NFL head coaching vacancy in the post-Rooney era than the pre-Rooney era.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Epple et al. (2008) (Journal: <i>Journal of Public Economic Theory</i>)	United States	Education: Ban on race-based AA and the resulting adoption of race-blind admission policies in higher education	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: College attendance 2nd Order: SAT scores	Estimation: Computational Model	Positive (+)^R Minorities are significantly hurt by the ban on AA. Minority presence in the top-tier of colleges declines by 35%.	Mixed (+/-) The ban on AA results in an increase in average SAT scores of non-whites in lower ranked colleges and a decline in higher-ranked colleges. This is a consequence of the reduced access of non-white students to higher-ranked colleges.	n.a.	Negative (-)^R Non-minorities gain from the ban on AA, but those gains are modest. For whites, a ban on AA improves college access particularly for those with relatively lower incomes and scores.
Epps (1998) (Journal: <i>Ohio State Law Journal</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Colleges and universities (because they accept federal contracts and grants) are required to demonstrate AA efforts	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Minority representation in faculty positions	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: After three decades of AA, a substantial gap remains between the proportion of minority students participating in higher education and the proportion of full-time minority faculty.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Gandara (2012) (Report)	United States	Education: SP1 (eliminated AA within the University of California) and Prop 209 (state-wide elimination)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Admission in Higher Education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+)^R Between 1995 and 1998, there was a 22% decline in enrolments of African American students and of 15% for Chicano/Latinos.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Garces (2012a) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Education: Grutter v. Bollinger (landmark Supreme Court case concerning AA in student admissions)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) Allowing the consideration of race in higher education admissions in Texas after Grutter helped increase the enrolment rates of students of colour in public graduate and professional schools in	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						the state in 2006, on average, by about 3.4%.			
Garces (2012b) (Journal: <i>The Review of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Education: Bans of AA	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R AA bans have reduced the enrolment of students of colour by about 12.2% across graduate programs.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Garces (2013) (Journal: <i>American Educational Research Journal</i>)	United States	Education: Bans of AA	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R After the implementation of AA bans, the greatest declines in the proportion of enrolled graduate students who are students of colour took place in the fields of engineering (26%), natural sciences (19%), and the social sciences (15.2%)—fields where students of colour are already the most underrepresented—with a slightly lower decline in the humanities (11.8%).	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Gilmer (2007) (Journal: <i>Journal of STEM Education</i>)	United States	Education: Academic Investment in Math and Science (BGSU AIMS)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Success in math, GPA, semester credit hours (SCH), retention and graduation rate	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) The BGSU AIMS program has demonstrated success in the intended areas of improved GPA's versus control groups, good retention, improved progress toward graduation (measured by SCH's) and graduation rates.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Griffin (1990) (Journal: <i>The Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order 11246	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	2nd Order: Firms' behavior and costs	Estimation: Translog cost function	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) The cost of complying with AA averaged 6.5% of costs for constrained firms in 1980.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Grove and Hussey (2011) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Racial preferences in college and university admission	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Admission 2nd Order: Grade point average, areas of concentration, degree completion, wages, promotion prospects, general work quality	Estimation: Fixed effect regression	Positive (+) Being black positively but weakly (10%-level) increases the likelihood of admission, such that blacks enjoy a 5% advantage over whites.	Insignificant Little evidence of negative mismatch effects due to admission preferences (blacks and Hispanics enjoy similar or even higher returns to selectivity than whites).	Negative (-) Asians are disadvantaged in admission relative to whites (being Asian decreases one's likelihood of acceptance by 6.3%).	n.a.
Harper and Griffin (2010) (Journal: <i>Harvard Journal of African American Public Policy</i>)	United States	Education: Preferential treatment or awarded points in college admissions	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: College access 1st Order: Experienced accusations of unfairness	Descriptive: Qualitative inquiry (data collected from 219 students)	Insignificant Participants attributed their college access not to AA but to Initiatives targeted specifically to lower-income students, including Whites. (These initiatives influenced access at all levels, from readiness to college choice to financing high tuition costs to persistence from freshman through senior year.)	Negative (-) While no participant was knowingly given preferential treatment or awarded points for his race in the college admissions process, the vast majority reported having been accused by White peers of being unfairly admitted via AA policies and practices.	n.a.	n.a.
Heckman (1989) (Working paper)	United States	Employment / Business: 1964 Civil Rights Bill	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Earnings gap (between blacks and whites)	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Mixed (+/-) The evidence on AA programs is mixed. While relative status of blacks increased over the period 1965-1981, absolute differentials in real earnings between blacks and whites widened over this period.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Heilig et al. (2019) (Journal:)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Ethnoracial and gender diversity	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Insignificant While some progress has been made toward gender equity, one of the biggest challenges is that ethno-	n.a.	Positive (+) The study shown that U.S. colleges and universities have not realized	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Hispanic Journal of Law and Policy)						racial diversity among tenured faculty continues to lag across institutional types.		much progress toward ethnoracial and gender faculty diversity in recent years-the exception being a modest increase (between 1-2%) in tenured Asians across institutional types.	
Heller (2002) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Proposition 209 and Initiative 200 (I-200)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education 2nd Order: Feelings of alienation and isolation	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+)^R Both African American and Hispanic enrollment representation decreased by nearly 60% in the first year I-200 was in place. Native American enrollment also dropped 26%. The enrollment numbers for Hawaiian Pacific Islanders dropped from a low number of 38 students to an even lower 11 students in the entire freshman class, a percent decrease of nearly 270%.	Positive (+)^R Administrators working with minority students reported an increase in feelings of alienation and isolation among these students following the passage of I-200.	n.a.	n.a.
Hicklin (2007) (Journal: Public Administration Review)	United States	Education: Hopwood judicial decision and California's Proposition 209	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: Value-Added Analysis	Mixed (+/-)^R For the most selective, highly selective, more selective universities, minority enrolments decreased significantly. For the universities considered non-selective, less selective, or simply selective, Hopwood and Prop 209 led to an increase in minority enrolments.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Hinrichs (2012)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour:	1st Order: College enrolment	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-)^R

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Journal: <i>The Review of Economics and Statistics</i>)			Blacks, Hispanics, Natives			Affirmative action bans decrease underrepresented minority enrolment at selective colleges.			Bans increase white enrolment at selective colleges.
Hinrichs (2014) (Journal: <i>Economics of Education Review</i>)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Number of graduates 2nd Order: Composition of students by initial qualification	Estimation: Regression analysis	Positive (+)^R AA bans lead to fewer underrepresented minorities becoming graduates of selective colleges.	Negative (-)^R Although the graduation rates for underrepresented minority groups at selective institutions rise when AA is banned, this may be due to the changing composition of students at these universities. Moreover, this effect is small relative to the number displaced from selective universities due to AA bans.	n.a.	n.a.
Holzer and Neumark (1999) (Journal: <i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA plans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Hires 2nd Order: Qualification and job performance	Estimation: DID	Insignificant The probability that a minority or female was hired is estimated to be significantly higher when AA is used in hiring.	Insignificant The results show that ratings of white female or black employees in establishments using AA are generally at least as high as those of other comparable workers. (These results are reversed only for Hispanic men, who receive significantly lower performance ratings.)	n.a.	n.a.
Holzer (1996) (Working Paper)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Executive Orders	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Employment	Estimation: Logit	Positive (+) AA raises the employment of most minority groups and females relative to white males.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) The presence of AA reduces the employment shares of white males by roughly 3.5 pts, or 10%.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
House-Soremekun (2007) (Journal: <i>Western New England Law Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Ohio House Bill 584	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Black business success (number of years the businesses had been in operation and total profits per year)	Estimation: OLS and Logistical Regressions	Positive (+) AA programs, and by extension minority set-aside programs, appear to have a positive and empirical impact on the success of Black business owners.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Hutchins and Sigelman (1981) (Journal: <i>Social Science Quarterly</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Equal Employment Opportunity Act	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Public employment 2nd Order: Salaries	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) In most states, black government employment is at least proportional to the black share of the population, but in every state except one, black salaries lag behind those of whites.	Insignificant But in every state except one, black salaries lag behind those of whites.	n.a.	n.a.
Jencks (1985) (Journal: <i>American Behavioral Scientist</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order 11246	Race/colour: Blacks	2nd Order: Earnings	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) Looking first at 25- to 34-year-olds, who are most likely to be affected by changing employment opportunities, we see that black male high school and college graduates both gained relative to their white counterparts during the 1960s. Black male college graduates gained even more during the 1970s, but black male high school graduates did not gain at all.	n.a.	n.a.
Kalev et al. (2006) (Journal:)	United States	Employment / Business: Range of AA and diversity measures	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Representation	Estimation: Cross-sectional time-series models	Mixed (+/-) AA structures establishing responsibility (AA plans, diversity committees, and diversity staff positions) are followed by significant	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>American Sociological Review</i>)						increases in managerial diversity. Programs that target managerial stereotyping through education and feedback (diversity training and diversity evaluations) are not followed by increases in diversity. Programs that address social isolation among women and minorities (networking and mentoring programs) are followed by modest changes.			
L. M. Lee (2021) (Journal: Michigan Law Review)	United States	Education: Supreme Court's ruling in Grutter v. Bollinger	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Matriculation 2nd Order: Degrees	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant: For Black students, matriculation and degrees awarded have remained stable on average but are considerably lower than the Black population nationally. For Latinx students, matriculation and degrees awarded have dramatically increased; the same is true, however, of the national Latinx population. As a result, the ratio of enrolment and degrees awarded to the respective populations has remained stagnant for both minority groups.		n.a.	n.a.
Leonard (1984) (Journal: Journal of Labor Economics)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order no. 11246	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Representation 2nd Order: Relative earnings and labour demand	Estimation: Multiple Regression Estimates	Positive (+) AA has led to improved employment opportunities for females and minorities.	Positive (+) The increase in the demand for black male labor relative to white induced by AA can help account for a significant part of the increase in the relative earnings of black males.	n.a.	n.a.
Lerner and Nagai (2000) (Journal: Academic Questions)	United States	Education: Racial preference in college admission	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+) The relative odds-ratio of black-to-white applicants, controlling for test scores, high school rank, legacy status, and residency is 111 to 1. That is, a black	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						applicant has over a hundred-to-one chance of admission compared to an equally qualified white candidate. The Hispanic candidate, controlling for all other variables, has a 4.85 to 1 odds-ratio, which is statistically significant, but the odds ratio is not as favourable as being black.			
Lin (2013) (Mimeo)	United States	Education: Elimination of AA in higher education admission	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Enrolment in higher education 2nd Order: Earnings	Descriptive: DID	Insignificant: In contrast with the expectation, eliminating affirmative action does not reduce the enrolment of minority students.	Insignificant: Observing the wage level of minority students 12 years after California ended AA, the study finds a negative but insignificant effect on the wage of California minority students who were influenced by the policy change in 1995.	n.a.	n.a.
McCrary (2007) (Journal: <i>American Economic Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Court-ordered AA in municipal police departments (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Employment share 2nd Order: Police performance	Estimation: Parametric Estimates	Positive (+) Substantial impact on work-force composition: 14-ppts gain in the fraction African American among newly hired officers.	Insignificant There is mixed evidence of differences in police performance between litigated and unlitigated departments, but the bulk of the evidence suggests little to no effect.		
Merritt and Reskin (1997) (Journal: <i>Columbia Law Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AAs in law faculty hiring	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Hire as professor	Estimation: OLS	Positive (+) White women and men of colour, but surprisingly not women of colour, began teaching at somewhat more prestigious schools than white men with comparable credentials.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						The advantage, however, was relatively modest.			
Mickey-Pabello and Garces (2018) (Journal: <i>American Journal of Education</i>)	United States	Education: AA bans	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Applications and admissions in higher education	Estimation: DID	Positive (+)^R The share of applications from underrepresented students of colour received by public medical schools dropped by a moderate 0.7 ppt after the bans, whereas the share of admitted students of colour dropped by 3.4 percentage points.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Naff and Kellough (2003) (Journal: <i>International Journal of Public Administration</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Diversity management programs.	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Employment equity	Estimation: Multiple regression	Insignificant For the most part, that there is little evidence that broad-based diversity programs, nor any of their programmatic components, have created a more equitable work environment for women or people of colour.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Niemann and Dovidio (2005) (Journal: <i>Journal of Social Issues</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA in higher education	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	2nd Order: Job satisfaction	Estimation: Multiple regression	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) AA that was seen as willingly pursued by the department was positively related to job satisfaction, whereas perceptions that it was imposed tended to be negatively related to satisfaction. This effect is mediated by how supportive colleagues are seen and how much self-doubt faculty experience.	n.a.	n.a.
Orfield and Whitley (2001)	United States	Education:	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	2nd Order: Student learning experiences	Descriptive: Comparison of means	n.a.	Positive (+) When asked to make an overall assessment of	n.a.	Positive (+) White students appear to have

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
(Book / book chapter)		U.S. Supreme Court's 1978 Bakke decision					whether diversity was a positive or negative element in their total educational experience, 89% of Harvard students and 91% of Michigan students reported a positive impact (the large majority reporting a strongly positive impact).		a particularly enriching experience, since they are by far the most likely to have grown up with little interracial contact.
Ready (2001) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Project 3000 by 2000 (campaign of U.S. medical schools to increase minority enrolment. Its goal is that 3,000 underrepresented minority students will matriculate annually at U.S. medical schools.	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Enrolment 2nd Order: Performance	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) After Project 3000 by 2000 was launched, the number of under-represented minority students entering medical school increased 36%, from 1,485 in 1990 to 2,024 in 1994, and remained virtually unchanged in 1995. The enrolment gains were made possible by a 65% increase in minority applications.	Positive (+) The minority students who entered medical school through these programs performed academically at levels comparable to those of other students admitted in traditional ways. Those admitted to the medical profession through AA have proved to be more likely to address the healthcare needs of minority and disadvantaged patients than other doctors.	n.a.	n.a.
Rodgers and Spriggs (1996) (Journal: <i>The American Economic Review</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Executive Order 11246	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Proportion of Minorities in establishment's work force	Estimation: Logit	Mixed (+/-) Federal-contract status remains significant in explaining the share of an establishment's work force that is African American or Hispanic. For African Americans, the effect is positive, while for Hispanic workers it is negative.	n.a.	n.a.	Negative (-) In 1982, federal-contract status increased the Asian share of an establishment's work force by 0.20 ppts and by 0.25 ppts in 1992.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
Rothstein and Yoon (2008a) (Working paper)	United States	Education: Race-based preferences in public university admissions (vs. simulation of admissions under race-blind policies)	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Admission in higher education 2nd Order: Number of Lawyers	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Positive (+) Race-based preferences have large effects on the number of black law students, and thereby on diversity in law schools. In absence of AA, black representation at the most selective schools would fall by 90%, but extent well beyond; all but the least selective schools would enrol 1/3 to 1/2 fewer black students than they do today.	Positive (+) Eliminating AA would dramatically reduce the number of blacks who become lawyers.	n.a.	n.a.
Rothstein and Yoon (2008b) (Working paper)	United States	Education: Race-based higher education admission preferences	Race/colour: Blacks	2nd Order: Grades, graduation, bar exam success and labour market experiences	Estimation: OLS and Probit	n.a.	Mixed (+/-) There is no evidence of mismatch effects on any students' employment outcomes or on the graduation or bar passage rates of black students with moderate or strong entering credentials. What evidence there is for mismatch comes from less-qualified black students who typically attend second- or third-tier schools. Many of these students would not have been admitted to any law school without preferences, however, and the resulting sample selection prevents strong conclusions.	n.a.	n.a.
Sander (2004) (Journal:	United States	Education: Supreme Court's Bakke decision	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Admission in higher education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Positive (+) For blacks, there are two primary benefits of AA.	Negative (-) Most black law applicants end up at	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/ marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
<i>Stanford Law Review</i>)		(Quota)		2nd Order: Performance of beneficiaries and success on postgraduate bar examinations		First, black students widely have the opportunity to attend significantly more elite schools than do white peers with similar credentials. Second, the system as a whole leads to the admission of an additional five or six hundred black students-about one seventh of the annual total-who would not otherwise be admitted to any accredited school.	schools where they will struggle academically and fail at higher rates than they would in the absence of preferences. The net trade-off of higher prestige but weaker academic performance substantially harms black performance on bar exams and harms most new black lawyers on the job market		
Sowell (1975) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil Rights Act of 1964	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Academic employment	Descriptive: Comparison of Means	Insignificant The pay differentials between minorities and other academics were less than \$100 per year before affirmative action and less than \$1,000 afterwards indicating that both the necessity for such programs and the effectiveness of them are open to serious question.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Sweet (2006) (Journal: Journal of Law and Society)	United States	Employment / Business: Government contracting AA programmes	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics	1st Order: Minority employment	Estimation: OLS	Insignificant AA in government contracting does not significantly increase minority employment and is statistically insignificant in eradicating discrimination in contracting.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Taylor (1994) (Journal: <i>Basic and Applied Social Psychology</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA practiced by employers	Race/colour: Blacks	2nd Order: Job Satisfaction, Work by Choice, Intrinsic Work Orientation, Ambition, Life	Estimation: Analyses of covariance (ANCOVAs)	n.a.	Positive (+) No evidence that benefiting from AA has detrimental social psychological consequences. On the	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
				Satisfaction, Health, Zest for Life, Happiness			contrary, those employed at AA workplaces show greater occupational ambition. There was also a nearly significant tendency for Blacks at AA firms to believe that other people are helpful.		
Turner et al. (1999) (Journal: <i>The Journal of Higher Education</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Civil rights legislation and programs by higher education institutions	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Representation in the academic workplace	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant Statistical and narrative data show the continued underrepresentation and exclusion of faculty of colour in the Midwestern colleges and universities despite civil rights legislation and programs by higher education institutions.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Welch and Gruhl (1998) (Book / book chapter)	United States	Education: Bakke decision (abolition of race as a definite and exclusive basis for university admission decisions) (Quota)	Race/colour: Blacks, Hispanics, Natives	1st Order: Admissions, applications, and enrolment in tertiary education	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant Most of these officials appeared to perceive that Bakke has had minimal impact on admissions policies. The overall growth in minority enrolments in the typical medical or law school between 1978, the time of Bakke, and 1987 was extremely small.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Yaffe (1995) Journal: <i>The American Review of Public Administration</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: Equal employment responsibilities	Race/colour: Hispanics	1st Order: Employment patterns for Latinas in management positions in local government	Descriptive: Comparison of means	Insignificant 25 years after Los Angeles County enacted comprehensive AA and equal employment policies, across both gender and ethnic or racial lines, Latinas remain the most underrepresented of any	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Autor(s) + year	Country	AA policy/ programme studied	Target group	Outcome(s) of interest	Analytical methods	Evaluation of first order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of second order effect(s) on target group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target minority/marginalised group(s)	Evaluation of effect(s) on non-target majority/non-marginalised group(s)
						protected group in management. This may be attributed more to the failure of elected officials to rationally and equitably apply the policies than to demographic availability or educational factors.			
Zhao and Lovrich (1998) (Journal: <i>Journal of Criminal Justice</i>)	United States	Employment / Business: AA as defined by federal courts and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) following the Equal Employment Opportunity Act 1972	Race/colour: Blacks	1st Order: Employment Participation	Estimation: OLS	Insignificant The influence of the presence of AA programs is weaker compared to previous studies. The significant effects of the presence of an African American mayor and the presence of a formal affirmative action program disappear after controlling for the influence of other explanatory variables.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Notes: ^R indices reverse coding, as the study investigates the effects of removing an ethnic AA policy.
Source: authors' elaboration.

Bibliography

- Alon, S. (2015). *Race, class, and affirmative action (Chapters 8 and 10)*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Alon, S., & Tienda, M. (2005). Assessing the “mismatch” hypothesis: Differences in college graduation rates by institutional selectivity. *Sociology of education*, 78(4), 294-315.
- Arcidiacono, P. (2005). Affirmative action in higher education: How do admission and financial aid rules affect future earnings? *Econometrica*, 73(5), 1477-1524.
- Arcidiacono, P., Aucejo, E., Coate, P., & Hotz, V. J. (2014). Affirmative action and university fit: Evidence from Proposition 209. *IZA Journal of Labor Economics*, 3(1), 1-29.
- Arcidiacono, P., & Lovenheim, M. (2016). Affirmative action and the quality-fit trade-off. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 54(1), 3-51.
- Ayres, I., & Brooks, R. (2004). Does affirmative action reduce the number of black lawyers. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 57, 1807.
- Bagde, S., Epple, D., & Taylor, L. (2016). Does affirmative action work? Caste, gender, college quality, and academic success in India. *American Economic Review*, 106(6), 1495-1521.
- Bamrah, I. S., & Girdhar, A. (2015). Investigation on impact of reservation policy on student enrollment using data mining. 2015 IEEE International Conference on Computational Intelligence and Computing Research (ICIC),
- Barlow, A. E., & Villarejo, M. (2004). Making a difference for minorities: Evaluation of an educational enrichment program. *Journal of research in science teaching*, 41(9), 861-881.
- Basant, R., & Sen, G. (2020). Quota-based Affirmative Action in higher education: impact on other backward classes in India. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 56(2), 336-360.
- Berry, R. M. (2004). Affirmative action in higher education: costs, benefits, and implementation. *Journal of Public Budgeting, Accounting & Financial Management*.
- Bertrand, M., Hanna, R., & Mullainathan, S. (2010). Affirmative action in education: Evidence from engineering college admissions in India. *Journal of Public Economics*, 94(1-2), 16-29.
- Bhattacharjee, A. (2019). Spillovers in Affirmative Action: Evidence from OBC Quotas in India. *Leeds University Business School Working Paper*(19-03).
- Bhavnani, R. R., & Lee, A. (2021). Does affirmative action worsen bureaucratic performance? evidence from the indian administrative service. *American Journal of Political Science*, 65(1), 5-20.
- Bleemer, Z. (2022). Affirmative Action, Mismatch, and Economic Mobility after California’s Proposition 209. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 137(1), 115-160. <https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjab027>
- Borooah, V. K. (2019). *Disparity and Discrimination in Labour Market Outcomes In India*. Springer.
- Burstein, P., & Edwards, M. E. (1994). The impact of employment discrimination litigation on racial disparity in earnings: evidence and unresolved issues. *Law and Society Review*, 79-111.
- Button, J. W., & Rienzo, B. A. (2003). The impact of affirmative action: Black employment in six southern cities. *Social Science Quarterly*, 84(1), 1-14.
- Caldwell, R. (2009). The Erosion of Affirmative Action and its Consequences for the Black-White Educational Attainment Gap. *University of Kansas Law Review*, 57, 813.
- Cassan, G. (2019). Affirmative action, education and gender: Evidence from India. *Journal of Development Economics*, 136, 51-70.
- Chambers, D. L., Clydesdale, T. T., Kidder, W. C., & Lempert, R. O. (2005). The real impact of eliminating affirmative action in American law schools: An empirical critique of Richard Sander's study. *Stanford Law Review*, 1855-1898.
- Charles, J. (2003). Diversity management: An exploratory assessment of minority group representation in state government. *Public Personnel Management*, 32(4), 561-577.
- Chatterji, A. K., Chay, K. Y., & Fairlie, R. W. (2014). The impact of city contracting set-asides on black self-employment and employment. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 32(3), 507-561.

- Conrad, C. A., & Sharpe, R. V. (1996). The impact of the California Civil Rights Initiative (CCRI) on university and professional school admissions and the implications for the California economy. *The Review of Black Political Economy*, 25(1), 13-59.
- Contreras, F. E. (2005). The reconstruction of merit post-Proposition 209. *Educational Policy*, 19(2), 371-395.
- Deshpande, A., & Ramachandran, R. (2019). Traditional hierarchies and affirmative action in a globalizing economy: Evidence from India. *World Development*, 118, 63-78. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2019.02.006>
- Deshpande, A., & Weisskopf, T. E. (2014). Does affirmative action reduce productivity? A case study of the Indian railways. *World Development*, 64, 169-180.
- Detterman, D. K. (2000). Tests, affirmative action in university admissions, and the American way. *Psychology, Public Policy, and Law*, 6(1), 44.
- Dobbin, F., & Kalev, A. (2015). Why firms need diversity managers and task forces. In A. Forsyth, H. Sheikh, & F. Sperotti (Eds.), *How global migration changes the workforce diversity equation* (pp. 170-198). Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Dometrius, N. C., & Sigelman, L. (1984). Assessing progress toward affirmative action goals in state and local government: A new benchmark. *Public Administration Review*, 241-246.
- DuBois, C. (2015). The impact of "soft" affirmative action policies on minority hiring in executive leadership: The case of the NFL's Rooney Rule. *American Law and Economics Review*, 18(1), 208-233.
- Epple, D., Romano, R., & Sieg, H. (2008). Diversity and affirmative action in higher education. *Journal of Public Economic Theory*, 10(4), 475-501.
- Epps, E. G. (1998). Affirmative action and minority access to faculty positions. *Ohio St. LJ*, 59, 755.
- Frisancho, V., & Krishna, K. (2016). Affirmative action in higher education in India: targeting, catch up, and mismatch. *Higher Education*, 71(5), 611-649.
- Gandara, P. (2012). California: A case study in the loss of affirmative action.
- Garces, L. M. (2012a). Necessary but not sufficient: The impact of Grutter v. Bollinger on student of color enrollment in graduate and professional schools in Texas. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 83(4), 497-534.
- Garces, L. M. (2012b). Racial diversity, legitimacy, and the citizenry: The impact of affirmative action bans on graduate school enrollment. *The Review of Higher Education*, 36(1), 93-132.
- Garces, L. M. (2013). Understanding the impact of affirmative action bans in different graduate fields of study. *American Educational Research Journal*, 50(2), 251-284.
- Gill, M. S. (2002). Reservation-An affirmative action of social justice? *Social Change*, 32(1-2), 27-38. <https://doi.org/10.1177/004908570203200202>
- Gille, V. (2013). Stigma in positive discrimination application? Evidence from quotas in education in India. Conference Paper, Centre d'Economie de la Sorbonne,
- Gilmer, T. (2007). An understanding of the improved grades, retention and graduation rates of STEM majors at the Academic Investment in Math and Science (AIMS) Program of Bowling Green State University (BGSU). *Journal of STEM Education*, 8(1).
- Griffin, P. B. (1990). *The impact of affirmative action on labor demand: A test of some implications of the Le Chatelier principle*. University of California, Santa Barbara.
- Grove, W., & Hussey, A. (2011). *Affirmative Action in MBA Programs: Investigating the Mismatch Hypothesis for Race and Gender*.
- Gulzar, S., Haas, N., & Pasquale, B. (2020). Does Political Affirmative Action Work, and for Whom? Theory and Evidence on India's Scheduled Areas. *American Political Science Review*, 114(4), 1230-1246. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0003055420000532>
- Harper, S. R., & Griffin, K. A. (2010). Opportunity beyond affirmative action: How low-income and working-class Black male achievers access highly selective, high-cost colleges and universities. *Harvard Journal of African American Public Policy*, 17, 43.
- Heckman, J. J. (1989). The impact of government on the economic status of black Americans.

- Heilig, J. V., Flores, I. W., Barros Souza, A. E., Barry, J. C., & Monroy, S. B. (2019). Considering the ethnoracial and gender diversity of faculty in United States college and university intellectual communities. *Hisp. JL & Pol'y*, 1.
- Heller, D. E. (2002). The role of institutional financial aid in increasing minority student enrollment in a post-Hopwood environment. *Ann Arbor*, 1001, 48109-41259.
- Hicklin, A. (2007). The effect of race-based admissions in public universities: Debunking the myths about hopwood and proposition 209. *Public Administration Review*, 67(2), 331-340.
- Higham, R., & Shah, A. (2013a). Affirmative action and political economic transformations: Secondary education, indigenous people, and the state in Jharkhand, India. *Focaal*, 2013(65), 80-93.
- Higham, R., & Shah, A. (2013b). Conservative force or contradictory resource? Education and affirmative action in Jharkhand, India. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 43(6), 718-739.
- Hinrichs, P. (2012). The effects of affirmative action bans on college enrollment, educational attainment, and the demographic composition of universities. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 94(3), 712-722.
- Hinrichs, P. (2014). Affirmative action bans and college graduation rates. *Economics of Education Review*, 42, 43-52.
- Holzer, H. (1996). *Employer hiring decisions and antidiscrimination policy*. Institute for Research on Poverty, University of Wisconsin-Madison.
- Holzer, H., & Neumark, D. (1999). Are affirmative action hires less qualified? Evidence from employer-employee data on new hires. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 17(3), 534-569.
- House-Soremekun, B. (2007). The impact of minority set-aside programs on black business success in Cleveland, Ohio: Implications for public policy. *W. New Eng. L. Rev.*, 30, 19.
- Howard, L. L., & Prakash, N. (2012). Do employment quotas explain the occupational choices of disadvantaged minorities in India? *International Review of Applied Economics*, 26(4), 489-513.
- Hutchins, M., & Sigelman, L. (1981). Black employment in state and local governments. *Social Science Quarterly*, 62(1), 79.
- Jencks, C. (1985). Affirmative action for blacks: Past, present, and future. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 28(6), 731-760.
- Kalev, A., Dobbin, F., & Kelly, E. (2006). Best Practices or Best Guesses? Assessing the Efficacy of Corporate Affirmative Action and Diversity Policies. *American Sociological Review*, 71(4), 589-617. <https://doi.org/10.1177/000312240607100404>
- Khanna, G. (2020). Does Affirmative Action Incentivize Schooling? Evidence from India. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 102(2), 219-233. https://doi.org/10.1162/rest_a_00848
- Kumar, D., Pratap, B., & Aggarwal, A. (2019). Affirmative Action in Government Jobs in India: Did the Job Reservation Policy Benefit Disadvantaged Groups? *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 55(1), 145-160. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0021909619871588>
- Lee, A. (2021). Does Affirmative Action Work? Evaluating India's Quota System. *Comparative Political Studies*, 54(9), 1534-1564. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414021989755>
- Lee, L. M. (2021). Affirmative Inaction: A Quantitative Analysis of Progress Toward "Critical Mass" in US Legal Education. *Michigan Law Review*, 119(5).
- Leonard, J. S. (1984). The Impact of Affirmative Action on Employment. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 2(4), 439-463. <https://doi.org/10.1086/298041>
- Lerner, R., & Nagai, A. K. (2000). Reverse discrimination by the numbers. *Academic Questions*, 13(3), 71.
- Lin, Y. (2013). *Does Elimination of Affirmative Action Affect Postsecondary Admission and Earnings? Evidence from California*. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Yuxin-Lin-5/publication/320022096_Does_Elimination_of_Affirmative_Action_Affect_Postsecondary_Admission_and_Earnings_Evidence_from_California/links/59c93454a6fdcc451d545712/Does-Elimination-of-Affirmative-Action-Affect-Postsecondary-Admission-and-Earnings-Evidence-from-California.pdf
- McCrary, J. (2007). The effect of court-ordered hiring quotas on the composition and quality of police. *American Economic Review*, 97(1), 318-353.

- Merritt, D. J., & Reskin, B. F. (1997). Sex, race, and credentials: The truth about affirmative action in law faculty hiring. *Colum. L. Rev.*, 97, 199.
- Mickey-Pabello, D., & Garces, L. M. (2018). Addressing racial health inequities: Understanding the impact of affirmative action bans on applications and admissions in medical schools. *American Journal of Education*, 125(1), 79-108.
- Naff, K. C., & Kellough, J. E. (2003). Ensuring employment equity: Are federal diversity programs making a difference? *International Journal of Public Administration*, 26(12), 1307-1336.
- Niemann, Y. F., & Dovidio, J. F. (2005). Affirmative action and job satisfaction: Understanding underlying processes. *Journal of Social Issues*, 61(3), 507-523.
- Orfield, G., & Whitley, D. (2001). Diversity and Legal Education: Student Experiences in Leading Law Schools. In G. Orfield (Ed.), *Diversity challenged: Evidence on the impact of affirmative action* (pp. 143-174). Harvard Education Publishing Group, Harvard Graduate School of Education.
- Ready, T. (2001). The Impact of Affirmative Action on Medical Education and the Nation's Health. In G. Orfield (Ed.), *Diversity challenged: Evidence on the impact of affirmative action* (pp. 205-220). Harvard Education Publishing Group, Harvard Graduate School of Education.
- Rodgers, W. M., & Spriggs, W. E. (1996). The effect of federal contractor status on racial differences in establishment-level employment shares: 1979-1992. *The American Economic Review*, 86(2), 290-293.
- Rothstein, J., & Yoon, A. (2008a). *Affirmative action in law school admissions: What do racial preferences do?*
- Rothstein, J., & Yoon, A. (2008b). *Mismatch in law school.*
- Sabharwal, N. S., Henderson, E. F., & Joseph, R. S. (2020). Hidden social exclusion in Indian academia: gender, caste and conference participation. *Gender and education*, 32(1), 27-42.
- Sander, R. H. (2004). A systemic analysis of affirmative action in American law schools. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 57, 367.
- Sheth, D. (2004). *Caste, ethnicity and exclusion in South Asia: the role of affirmative action policies in building inclusive societies.*
- Sowell, T. (1975). *Affirmative Action Reconsidered: Was It Necessary.* Washington, D, C: American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research.
- Sweet, M. J. (2006). Minority business enterprise programmes in the United States of America: An empirical investigation. *Journal of Law and Society*, 33(1), 160-180.
- Taylor, M. C. (1994). Impact of Affirmative Action on Beneficiary Groups: Evidence From the 1990 General Social Survey. *Basic and Applied Social Psychology*, 15(1-2), 143-178. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01973533.1994.9646076>
- Turner, C. S. V., Myers Jr, S. L., & Creswell, J. W. (1999). Exploring underrepresentation: The case of faculty of color in the Midwest. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 70(1), 27-59.
- Welch, S., & Gruhl, J. (1998). *Affirmative action and minority enrollments in medical and law schools.* University of Michigan Press.
- Xaxa, V. (2001). Protective discrimination: Why scheduled tribes lag behind scheduled castes. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2765-2772.
- Yaffe, J. (1995). Government's Role in the under Representation of Latinas in Public Employment. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 25(4), 303-326.
- Zhao, J., & Lovrich, N. (1998). Determinants of minority employment in American municipal police agencies: The representation of African American officers. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 26(4), 267-277.